# A collaboration of service providers & large operators of OpenStack – Meeting Minutes

August 31 7:30PM PT | Sept 1 2:30AMUTC+-0 Videoconference

## Meeting Summary

## Attendees

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Company** | **Name** |
| AT&T | Cecilia Comeaux |
| AT&T | Jamey McCabe |
| AT&T | Andy Ukasick |
| NTT | Shintaro Mizuno |
| Orange | Laurent Leboucher |
| Reliance Jio | Kunal Shah |
| Reliance Jio | Aditya Mani, |
| Reliance Jio | Sanjeev Jaiswal |
| Walmart | Sean Roberts |

## Agenda Topics Covered/Discussion from Etherpad

    initial remark: L. Leboucher will involve Abdelhadi Chari from Orange as well (as of next week)

1. Workplan for Barcelona Scope - Jamey is proposing to create the workplan for what it will take to get Scope ready for Barcelona - User Stories and Use Cases to Product Working Group.
   1. Per Sean - proposed we make URL/github of user story public as soon as possible
2. Next steps for group Charter / recogition as OpenStack Working Group
   1. Joint discussion/proposal for the group charter - before sending to Foundation  - Andy published a draft to the LCOO group
      1. looks good to me (sean)
      2. Jamey proposing that each company indicate their acceptance and then Jamey will take it to the Foundation team for their feedback and to help us with the limitation to those with commitment - agreed to finalize in next weekmeeting
3. further refine the common objectives and technical scope
   1. Item we want to invstigate for longer term and/or outside of the OpenStack release
      1. Containers
         1. Kolla - AT&T and NTT is looking into this
         2. Kubernetes - > Laurent will check with Orange team working on containers to explain how we could contribute
         3. Docker Containers
         4. Magnum - Containers for tenant
         5. OpenStack-Ansible uses LXC to deploy
      2. Contrail use
      3. ORM (AT&Ts Openstack Resource Management)  proposed Open Source+1
      4. Policy - Congress (Governance as a Service)
         1. this is an openstack project, why investigate outside of openstack?
         2. investigate common policy description and upsteam the usecse and/or policy files would be an idea
      5. Backporting of other things into versions we have in production right now - Kilo/Juno
      6. Interested in an strategic architectural discussion regarding skip level and general upgrade tools, methodologies, process, etc to adopt for future.  For example stick with Fuel?.
   2. Items to further detail as potential for Barcelona Summit/Ocata Release
      1. we should add the use case, blueprint, patch urls here if exist
      2. Telemetry(AT&T/JIO)
         * Agreed to looking into how we use or would like to use Ceilometer and what use cases need improvement+1Cecilia+1Laurent +1Kunal
           + I would look into moving most of the functionality down to the meter level
           + The meters should push data out for collection – the pull mechanism is too heavy for large scale clouds
           + For compute an individual metric does not really mean much in of itself, when evaluated over a period of time it takes on significance

a.       Example, if I poll a Nova instance and it tells me the CPU is running at 90% it could be just a momentary spike. Over 3-5 minutes it might trigger an auto-scaling event.

* + - * + Storing fine-grained metrics in a MongoDB is very taxing on the infrastructure. MongoDB is does not performan. As mentioned above, keeping such fine-grained metrics is not necessary.
        + The notification events need more documentation and implementation.
        + Celiometer scaling and performance tuning needs to be looked at. It breaks RabbitMQ at high load and volume of messages.
    1. Logging(all 3 interested, Sean interested)
       1. Agreed to look into upstreaming filtering criteria for sorting through the various logs to separate true errors from items of telemetry from things we do not typically care about.
       2. Agreed that improvements in what is making into the logs and making them more standardized across projects is also a valid set of user stories but maybe beyond scope for Ocata release.
       3. Anyone interested in LMA/Stacklight from Mirantis? Stacklight logging and monitoring is very exhaustive. Reliance will be implementing LMA.
       4. use of elastic search
       5. **Existing Logging BluePrints**
          1. Monasca
          2. <https://wiki.openstack.org/wiki/Monasca>
          3. **Notes: Tenant Monitoring as a service**
          4. Monasca is a open-source multi-tenant, highly scalable, performant, fault-tolerant monitoring-as-a-service solution that integrates with OpenStack. It uses a REST API for high-speed metrics processing and querying and has a streaming alarm engine and notification engine.
       6. LMA Toolchain without Fuel
          1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/lma-toolchain/+spec/lma-without-fuel>
          2. **Notes: Approved | ver. 0.9**
          3. Mirantis Logging Monitoring Analysis Tool that is being developed for fuel. This is an initiative to remove all the Fuel dependencies and run external to Fuel. Could help contribute and develop which would give a good jumpstart to logging for OS
       7. Persist last error message and display on 'show'
          1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/trove/+spec/persist-error-message>
          2. **Notes: Approved | Newton | Trove**
          3. Persist scattered errors to the database for end user consumption
       8. "Failure Summary" Messages
          1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/cinder/+spec/summarymessage>
          2. **Notes: Approved | Newton | Cinder, Horizon**
          3. Operations like create volume, delete volume etc, if operation fails - user gets no specific information about why operation failed...just operation status is updated and shown as failed. One need to debug logs and other details to find the issue. It would be very helpful if such information can be shown on Summary section/screen on one separate tab on HORIZON for cinder.
       9. Provide the user with access to the logs
          1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/heat/+spec/user-visible-logs>
          2. **Notes: Discussion | Heat**
          3. When Heat is run by Cloud provider then log messages will never be visible to the end user.
          4. Lots of useful messages when debugging a template could be valuable to end users if provided a way for them to access those logs.
       10. Enable audit
           1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/congress/+spec/enable-audit>
           2. **Notes: Approved |  Congress**

Congress should persistently log pertinent information. Ideally this would include

* + - * 1. - policy violations
        2. - changes in the policy definitions
        3. - changes in the data
        4. - the actions that were executed
      1. Improve Scheduler Logging
         1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/nova/+spec/improve-sched-logging>
         2. **Notes: Pending Approval | Newton | Nova**
         3. Nova scheduler includes a number of very complicated filters with
         4. non-obvious failure modes (the NUMATopologyFilter in particular comes to mind).
         5. It is possible to have a situation where a given instances fails to schedule,
         6. and it is not immediately apparent as to what exactly caused the failure
      2. Log Request ID Mappings (partial)
         1. <https://blueprints.launchpad.net/nova/+spec/log-request-id-mappings>
         2. **Notes: Started | Nova**
         3. Each OpenStack service has sends a request ID header with HTTP responses. This value can be useful for tracking down problems in the logs. However, when operations cross service boundaries, this tracking can become difficult, as
         4. each service has its own request ID. This becomes especially problematic when requests are coming in parallel. For example, nova will call to glance for images, but that glance instance may be handling several other requests at the same time. By logging a mapping of nova's request ID and glance's request ID on the same log line, the user can easily find the glance request ID that is related to his nova request in the n-api log. That glance request ID can then be searched for in glance's logs.
         5. NTT is working on this one and is almost done.
    1. Tempest +1Shintaro+1Andre+1Kunal
       1. Agreed that adding test cases and scenarios that our teams already implement to the upstream will imporve the entire develpment, release and upgrade cycle.
       2. getting the Mirantis testing team and OPNFV involved. what does that look like?Laurent will check with the Orange team involved in that space
    2. Upgradeability
       1. Agreed that the main common objective is to have "upgrade in place" but this is much larger/not doable as Ocata scope
       2. Also a common goal to enable of skip (skip version) upgrades.  We should investigate this, perhaps for mitaka to ocata as scope in ocata
    3. OpenStack Resource Management (see below for demo plan)
    4. Other/continuing discussion?
    5. Network -> neutron/bgpvpn of interest for this community ?<http://www.slideshare.net/ThomasMorin1/openstack-neutron-interconnections-with-bgpmpls-vpns>
    7. Watcher (sean)
       1. general assistance to a new project
    8. Craton (sean)
       1. general assistance to a new project
    9. Galaxy (Sean)
       1. Multi-cluster horizon extension. Not currently an horizon plug-in this would be the first thing to investigate
    10. Application Lifecycle, Burst to Cloud, Workload portability (sean)
        1. OneOps
        2. This project is outside of OpenStack right now. It may join OpenStack soon. Stay tuned
    11. Resource reservation (from OPNFV Promise project)
        1. OpanStack Blazar (not active?) or new one? <https://launchpad.net/blazar>, looks like it has stalled or stablized
        2. if we can use any of the existing ORMs for this usecase it would be great. Promise project does not have a solution yet.
    12. Gluon - Sits between Nova and Neutron - does port mapping.  AT&T recent project into OpenStack
        1. <https://wiki.openstack.org/wiki/Gluon>
  1. need time to review

1. Schedule the subsequent sections agreed to in 08/21 meeting - the items below are ntings/subteams to be formed in prioirity order
   1. ORM Demo to be scheduled/given by AT&T - Maybe this should be also an intro to other Orchestration Managment projects which Sean knows of (OneOps,Craton,Galaxy,Watcher) as well as Promise which Shintaro knows of
   2. Existing Tempest Sharing across companies with goal to bring back upstream
   3. Logging/LMA pull
   4. Containers Laurent will check with Orange team working on containers
      1. Each team research what tools we already have which could be shared to improve the major upgrades ideally to skip release
   5. Contrail use at Reliance and AT&T and Orange
2. NDA - Proposed by AT&T Non disclosures signed by each company to promote more free sharing of information without worry of disclosure.  Following comes form the last meeting:
   1. It was FURTHER proposed  this become a policy in our charter - that all members and any new member would put in place NDA with the other members. A
   2. It was pointed out that the nature of upstreaming is to be disclosed to all so perhaps we need to stay off any discussion which might require NDA.
   3. It will cause debate and questions by Foundation to include in the Charter
   4. It will likely discourage other companies from joining
      1. Reliance Jio asked to take the topic offline with AT&T

## Next Session

1. Sept 7 Wednesday 9:30PM CT, 7:30PM PT, September 8 Thursday 11:30AM Japan T, 8:00 AM India T.

## Action Items

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Create workplan for getting some combined scope/use case to Barecelona Summit/Ocata release | Jamey |
| 2 | Finish company review/feedback of Charter | NTT, Reliance Jio, Orange |
| 3 | will check with the Orange team involved in that space. RE:   1. Tempest +1+1+1 2. getting the Mirantis testing team and OPNFV involved. what does that look like?Laurent will check with the Orange team involved in that space | Laurent |
| 4 | Reliance Jio to take topic of NDA up with AT&T offline | Kunal |
| 5 | Assign team members from you company for deep dive collaboration sessions | All |
| 6 | Schedule next meetings | Jamey |